

DRAFT  
New York City Citizen Review Panel  
December 7, 2006 Minutes

*Attendees:*

Eric Brettschneider	David Lansner	Jocelyn Brown
Marion White	Yvonne Plummer	Gerard Papa
Mathea Rubin	Sania Metzger	

*OCFS:* Renee Rider  
Mary Jane Coilparampil

*SCAA:* Karen Schimke  
Diane Mastin

*Handouts:*

- Meeting Agenda
- 2006 Recommendations Working Draft
- Draft Eastern/Western Panel Recommendations
- May 19, 2006 Minutes
- Draft 2007-2008 Activities
- Draft Operating Guidelines
- Draft letter to Governor-Elect Spitzer
- Report of The Interagency Task Force on Child Welfare and Safety
- Proposed NYC Legislation: No. 471
- Working to Develop a Home Visiting System in New York State
- NCCR Child Welfare Blog: The Definition of Insanity

The panel extended a welcome to Renee Rider who attended the meeting, replacing Dick Nells from OCFS. The minutes of the November 7<sup>th</sup> meeting were approved by a vote of 6 to 1 with one abstention.

The panel continued their discussion on the cases they agreed to review. They agreed to invite a number of people familiar with the Nixzmary case and the Mayor's Interagency Task Force to attend their March meeting for further discussion. Panel expressed interest in knowing how recommendations from the Interagency Task Force are moving forward and being implemented and what further insights and recommendations can be made regarding policies, procedures, and practices by talking with those who have been involved over the 9 months that the Task Force worked. For those interested in further discussion on the one case, a phone conference call will be arranged. Regarding the third case, the panel approved content for a letter to ACS requesting further information and additional records. The panel is particularly interested in receiving medical records and the case records beyond the 60 days provided by ACS. Panel commented on the poor condition of the records that were turned over to them. The panel looks to ACS to share records with the panel that are both complete and well organized.

OCFS staff reported that the panel's request for child fatality reviews has been approved. Reports will now be forwarded.

Panel members expressed difficulty in conducting reviews on the cases given a lack of time available to devote to this work and the time it takes to review one case. Gerard Papa pointed out the structural inadequacies of the panels, that they have been given the authority to do such reviews but have neither the time nor the resources to conduct them. He also believes that there were delays in receiving the records on the cases which he attributes in part to ACS and the co-chairs of the panel. Eric Brettschneider stated his opinion that he agrees with the assessment that the panels lack resources and power but does not agree that the co-chairs were responsible for any delays in obtaining records.

Panel approved the content of a letter to be sent to Governor-Elect Spitzer from the panels by a vote of 6 to 1 with 1 abstention.

Discussion centered on the panel's annual report and recommendations, whether or not to offer a separate report from the New York City panel or to join the Eastern and Western panels in their report and set of recommendations. The panel reviewed the recommendations that the Eastern and Western Panels have proposed for 2006. By a vote of 6 in favor, 1 opposed and 1 abstention, the panel agreed to the recommendations made by the Eastern and Western panels with revisions. The panel also agreed to offer two new recommendations. The new recommendations will be circulated to the Eastern and Western panels for their agreement.

SCAA staff was asked to poll panel members about a meeting date change. The next meeting of the panel is scheduled for January 4<sup>th</sup>. There was interest in moving the meeting to January 11th.

Gerard Papa requested that the first item on the agenda for this meeting be a discussion of by-laws.